

Theme 1: Abstract Reasoning

Lecture 1: Abstract Data Types & Recursive Functions

Ahmed Bouajjani

Paris Diderot University – Paris 7

January 2014

Data manipulation

- Programs transform data
- They implement functions between inputs and outputs
- Examples of data domains: Booleans, Characters, Integers, Reals, Strings, Lists, Trees, etc.

Data manipulation

- Programs transform data
- They implement functions between inputs and outputs
- Examples of data domains: Booleans, Characters, Integers, Reals, Strings, Lists, Trees, etc.
- A function has a *type* (domain and co-domain):

$$f : D_1 \times \cdots \times D_n \rightarrow D$$

- Examples:

$$\wedge : Boolean \times Boolean \rightarrow Boolean$$

$$+ : Nat \times Nat \rightarrow Nat$$

$$Sort : List[Nat] \rightarrow List[Nat]$$

Data manipulation

- Programs transform data
- They implement functions between inputs and outputs
- Examples of data domains: Booleans, Characters, Integers, Reals, Strings, Lists, Trees, etc.
- A function has a *type* (domain and co-domain):

$$f : D_1 \times \cdots \times D_n \rightarrow D$$

- Examples:

$$\wedge : Boolean \times Boolean \rightarrow Boolean$$

$$+ : Nat \times Nat \rightarrow Nat$$

$$Sort : List[Nat] \rightarrow List[Nat]$$

- Types must be given precisely. This avoids many errors.

Defining Functions

- Finite data domains: Enumeration of its values
- Example:

$$0 \wedge 0 = 0$$

$$0 \wedge 1 = 0$$

$$1 \wedge 0 = 0$$

$$1 \wedge 1 = 1$$

Defining Functions

- Finite data domains: Enumeration of its values
- Example:

$$0 \wedge 0 = 0$$

$$0 \wedge 1 = 0$$

$$1 \wedge 0 = 0$$

$$1 \wedge 1 = 1$$

- Not always practical, but possible in theory
- A more compact definition using a conditional construct:
 $x \wedge y = (\text{if } x = 0 \text{ then } 0 \text{ else } y)$

Defining Functions

- Finite data domains: Enumeration of its values
- Example:

$$0 \wedge 0 = 0$$

$$0 \wedge 1 = 0$$

$$1 \wedge 0 = 0$$

$$1 \wedge 1 = 1$$

- Not always practical, but possible in theory
- A more compact definition using a conditional construct:
 $x \wedge y = (\text{if } x = 0 \text{ then } 0 \text{ else } y)$
- How to write functions over infinite domains ?

Defining Functions

- Finite data domains: Enumeration of its values
- Example:

$$0 \wedge 0 = 0$$

$$0 \wedge 1 = 0$$

$$1 \wedge 0 = 0$$

$$1 \wedge 1 = 1$$

- Not always practical, but possible in theory
- A more compact definition using a conditional construct:
 $x \wedge y = (\text{if } x = 0 \text{ then } 0 \text{ else } y)$
- How to write functions over infinite domains ?
- We need more powerful constructs
- We need to give a structure to infinite data domains

Inductive Definition of (Potentially Infinite) Sets

- An element (object) is either basic or constructed from other objects.

Inductive Definition of (Potentially Infinite) Sets

- An element (object) is either basic or constructed from other objects.
- A set is defined by a set of constants and a set of constructors
- Example: The set Nat of natural numbers
 - ▶ Constant:

$0 : \text{Nat}$

- ▶ Constructor:

$s : \text{Nat} \rightarrow \text{Nat}$

Inductive Definition of (Potentially Infinite) Sets

- An element (object) is either basic or constructed from other objects.
- A set is defined by a set of constants and a set of constructors
- Example: The set Nat of natural numbers

- ▶ Constant:

$$0 : \text{Nat}$$

- ▶ Constructor:

$$s : \text{Nat} \rightarrow \text{Nat}$$

- Example of elements of Nat :

$$0, s(0), s(s(0)), s(s(s(0))), \dots$$

- Notation: n abbreviates $s^n(0)$

The General Schema

- Given a set of constants $C = \{c_1, \dots, c_m\}$,
- Given a set of constructors of the form $\alpha : D^n \times A \rightarrow D$
- The set of elements of D is the smallest set such that:
 - ▶ $C \subseteq D$
 - ▶ For every constructor $\alpha : D^n \times A \rightarrow D$, for every $d_1, \dots, d_n \in D$, and every $a \in A$, $\alpha(d_1, \dots, d_n, a) \in D$

The Domain of Lists

- Examples of lists:
 - ▶ $[2; 5; 8; 5]$ list of natural numbers
 - ▶ $[p; a; r; i; s]$ list of characters
 - ▶ $[[0; 2]; [2; 5; 2; 0]]$ list of lists of natural numbers

The Domain of Lists

- Examples of lists:
 - ▶ $[2; 5; 8; 5]$ list of natural numbers
 - ▶ $[p; a; r; i; s]$ list of characters
 - ▶ $[[0; 2]; [2; 5; 2; 0]]$ list of lists of natural numbers
- The domain $List[\star]$ parametrized by a domain \star :
 - ▶ Constant:
$$[] : List[\star]$$
 - ▶ Left-concatenation:
$$\cdot : \star \times List[\star] \rightarrow List[\star]$$

The Domain of Lists

- Examples of lists:
 - ▶ $[2; 5; 8; 5]$ list of natural numbers
 - ▶ $[p; a; r; i; s]$ list of characters
 - ▶ $[[0; 2]; [2; 5; 2; 0]]$ list of lists of natural numbers
- The domain $List[\star]$ parametrized by a domain \star :
 - ▶ Constant:
$$[] : List[\star]$$
 - ▶ Left-concatenation:
$$\cdot : \star \times List[\star] \rightarrow List[\star]$$
- Examples:
 - ▶ $0 \cdot [] = [0]$
 - ▶ $2 \cdot (5 \cdot (8 \cdot (5 \cdot []))) = 2 \cdot 5 \cdot 8 \cdot 5 \cdot [] = [2; 5; 8; 5]$
 - ▶ $(0 \cdot []) \cdot [] = [[0]]$
 - ▶ $[] \cdot [] = [[]] \neq []$
 - ▶ $(0 \cdot []) \cdot ((2 \cdot []) \cdot []) = [[0]; [2]]$

Defining functions over inductively defined sets

Let $f : Nat \rightarrow D$. Define $f(x)$, for every $x \in Nat$.

- Case splitting using the structure of the elements

- ▶ $f(0) = ?$
- ▶ $f(s(x)) = ?$

Defining functions over inductively defined sets

Let $f : Nat \rightarrow D$. Define $f(x)$, for every $x \in Nat$.

- Case splitting using the structure of the elements
 - ▶ $f(0) = ?$
 - ▶ $f(s(x)) = ?$
- Inductive definition (Recursion)

Define $f(s(x))$ assuming that we know how to compute $f(x)$

Defining functions over inductively defined sets

Let $f : Nat \rightarrow D$. Define $f(x)$, for every $x \in Nat$.

- Case splitting using the structure of the elements

- ▶ $f(0) = ?$
- ▶ $f(s(x)) = ?$

- Inductive definition (Recursion)

Define $f(s(x))$ assuming that we know how to compute $f(x)$

- Similar to proofs using structural induction

Prove $P(0)$, and prove that $P(s(x))$ holds assuming $P(x)$.

Recursion: An Example

- Addition $+ : Nat \times Nat \rightarrow Nat$

Recursion: An Example

- Addition $+ : Nat \times Nat \rightarrow Nat$
- Recursive definition

$$\begin{aligned} 0 + x &= x \\ s(x_1) + x_2 &= s(x_1 + x_2) \end{aligned}$$

Recursion: An Example

- Addition $+ : Nat \times Nat \rightarrow Nat$
- Recursive definition

$$\begin{aligned} 0 + x &= x \\ s(x_1) + x_2 &= s(x_1 + x_2) \end{aligned}$$

- Computation

$$\begin{aligned} s(s(0)) + s(0) &= s(s(0) + s(0)) \\ &= s(s(0 + s(0))) \\ &= s(s(s(0))) \end{aligned}$$

Recursion: Another Example

- Append function $\text{@} : \text{List}[\star] \times \text{List}[\star] \rightarrow \text{List}[\star]$
- Example: $[2; 5; 7]\text{@}[1; 5] = [2; 5; 7; 1; 5]$

Recursion: Another Example

- Append function $\text{@} : \text{List}[\star] \times \text{List}[\star] \rightarrow \text{List}[\star]$
- Example: $[2; 5; 7]\text{@}[1; 5] = [2; 5; 7; 1; 5]$
- Recursive definition

$$\begin{aligned} []\text{@}\ell &= \\ (a \cdot \ell_1)\text{@}\ell_2 &= \end{aligned}$$

Recursion: Another Example

- Append function $\text{@} : \text{List}[\star] \times \text{List}[\star] \rightarrow \text{List}[\star]$
- Example: $[2; 5; 7]\text{@}[1; 5] = [2; 5; 7; 1; 5]$
- Recursive definition

$$\begin{aligned} []\text{@}\ell &= \ell \\ (a \cdot \ell_1)\text{@}\ell_2 &= \end{aligned}$$

Recursion: Another Example

- Append function $\text{@} : \text{List}[\star] \times \text{List}[\star] \rightarrow \text{List}[\star]$
- Example: $[2; 5; 7]\text{@}[1; 5] = [2; 5; 7; 1; 5]$
- Recursive definition

$$\begin{aligned} []\text{@}\ell &= \ell \\ (a \cdot \ell_1)\text{@}\ell_2 &= a \cdot (\ell_1\text{@}\ell_2) \end{aligned}$$

Recursion: Another Example

- Append function $\text{@} : \text{List}[\star] \times \text{List}[\star] \rightarrow \text{List}[\star]$
- Example: $[2; 5; 7]\text{@}[1; 5] = [2; 5; 7; 1; 5]$
- Recursive definition

$$\begin{aligned} []\text{@}\ell &= \ell \\ (a \cdot \ell_1)\text{@}\ell_2 &= a \cdot (\ell_1\text{@}\ell_2) \end{aligned}$$

- Computation:

$$\begin{aligned} (2 \cdot 5 \cdot 7 \cdot [])\text{@}(1 \cdot 5 \cdot []) &= 2 \cdot ((5 \cdot 7 \cdot [])\text{@}(1 \cdot 5 \cdot [])) \\ &= 2 \cdot 5 \cdot ((7 \cdot [])\text{@}(1 \cdot 5 \cdot [])) \\ &= 2 \cdot 5 \cdot 7 \cdot ([]\text{@}(1 \cdot 5 \cdot [])) \\ &= 2 \cdot 5 \cdot 7 \cdot 1 \cdot 5 \cdot [] \end{aligned}$$

Composition: Functions can call other functions

- Multiplication $* : \text{Nat} \times \text{Nat} \rightarrow \text{Nat}$

Composition: Functions can call other functions

- Multiplication $* : Nat \times Nat \rightarrow Nat$
- Recursive definition

$$0 * x =$$

$$s(x_1) * x_2 =$$

Composition: Functions can call other functions

- Multiplication $* : Nat \times Nat \rightarrow Nat$
- Recursive definition

$$0 * x = 0$$

$$s(x_1) * x_2 =$$

Composition: Functions can call other functions

- Multiplication $* : Nat \times Nat \rightarrow Nat$
- Recursive definition

$$0 * x = 0$$

$$s(x_1) * x_2 = (x_1 * x_2) + x_2$$

Composition: Functions can call other functions

- Multiplication $* : Nat \times Nat \rightarrow Nat$
- Recursive definition

$$0 * x = 0$$

$$s(x_1) * x_2 = (x_1 * x_2) + x_2$$

- Computation

$$\begin{aligned} s^2(0) * s^3(0) &= (s(0) * s^3(0)) + s^3(0) \\ &= ((0 * s^3(0)) + s^3(0)) + s^3(0) \\ &= (0 + s^3(0)) + s^3(0) \\ &= s^3(0) + s^3(0) = s(s^2(0)) + s^3(0) \\ &= s(s^2(0) + s^3(0)) \\ &= s(s(s(0) + s^3(0))) \\ &= s(s(s(0 + s^3(0)))) \\ &= s(s(s(s^3(0)))) = s^6(0) \end{aligned}$$

Composition: Another Example

- Factorial function $\text{fact} : \text{Nat} \rightarrow \text{Nat}$

Composition: Another Example

- Factorial function $\text{fact} : \text{Nat} \rightarrow \text{Nat}$
- Recursive definition

$$\text{fact}(0) =$$

$$\text{fact}(s(x)) =$$

Composition: Another Example

- Factorial function $\text{fact} : \text{Nat} \rightarrow \text{Nat}$
- Recursive definition

$$\begin{aligned}\text{fact}(0) &= s(0) \\ \text{fact}(s(x)) &= \end{aligned}$$

Composition: Another Example

- Factorial function $\text{fact} : \text{Nat} \rightarrow \text{Nat}$
- Recursive definition

$$\begin{aligned}\text{fact}(0) &= s(0) \\ \text{fact}(s(x)) &= s(x) * \text{fact}(x)\end{aligned}$$

Composition: Another Example

- Factorial function $\text{fact} : \text{Nat} \rightarrow \text{Nat}$
- Recursive definition

$$\begin{aligned}\text{fact}(0) &= s(0) \\ \text{fact}(s(x)) &= s(x) * \text{fact}(x)\end{aligned}$$

- Computation

$$\begin{aligned}\text{fact}(s(s(0))) &= s(s(0)) * \text{fact}(s(0)) \\ &= s(s(0)) * (s(0) * \text{fact}(0)) \\ &= s(s(0)) * (s(0) * s(0)) \\ &= s(0) * (s(0) * s(0)) + s(0) * s(0) \\ &= 0 * (s(0) * s(0)) + s(0) * s(0) + s(0) * s(0) \\ &= \dots\end{aligned}$$

Composition: Yet Another Example

- Reverse function $\text{Rev} : \text{List}[\star] \rightarrow \text{List}[\star]$
- Example: $\text{Rev}([2; 5; 2; 1]) = [1; 2; 5; 2]$

Composition: Yet Another Example

- Reverse function $\text{Rev} : \text{List}[\star] \rightarrow \text{List}[\star]$
- Example: $\text{Rev}([2; 5; 2; 1]) = [1; 2; 5; 2]$
- Recursive definition:

$$\begin{aligned}\text{Rev}([]) &= \\ \text{Rev}(a \cdot \ell) &= \end{aligned}$$

Composition: Yet Another Example

- Reverse function $\text{Rev} : \text{List}[\star] \rightarrow \text{List}[\star]$
- Example: $\text{Rev}([2; 5; 2; 1]) = [1; 2; 5; 2]$
- Recursive definition:

$$\text{Rev}([]) = []$$

$$\text{Rev}(a \cdot \ell) =$$

Composition: Yet Another Example

- Reverse function $\text{Rev} : \text{List}[\star] \rightarrow \text{List}[\star]$
- Example: $\text{Rev}([2; 5; 2; 1]) = [1; 2; 5; 2]$
- Recursive definition:

$$\begin{aligned}\text{Rev}([]) &= [] \\ \text{Rev}(a \cdot \ell) &= \text{Rev}(\ell) @ [a]\end{aligned}$$

Composition: Yet Another Example

- Reverse function $\text{Rev} : \text{List}[\star] \rightarrow \text{List}[\star]$
- Example: $\text{Rev}([2; 5; 2; 1]) = [1; 2; 5; 2]$
- Recursive definition:

$$\begin{aligned}\text{Rev}([]) &= [] \\ \text{Rev}(a \cdot \ell) &= \text{Rev}(\ell) @ [a]\end{aligned}$$

- Computation

$$\begin{aligned}\text{Rev}([2; 5; 1]) &= \text{Rev}([5; 1]) @ [2] \\ &= (\text{Rev}([1]) @ [5]) @ [2] \\ &= ((\text{Rev}([]) @ [1]) @ [5]) @ [2] \\ &= ([1] @ [5]) @ [2] \\ &= [1; 5] @ [2] \\ &\dots \\ &= [1; 5; 2]\end{aligned}$$

Functions between different domains

- The Length function $|\cdot| : List[\star] \rightarrow Nat$

Functions between different domains

- The Length function $|\cdot| : List[\star] \rightarrow Nat$

$$|[]| = 0$$

$$|a \cdot \ell| = s(|\ell|)$$

Functions between different domains

- The Length function $|\cdot| : List[\star] \rightarrow Nat$

$$\begin{aligned} |[]| &= 0 \\ |a \cdot \ell| &= s(|\ell|) \end{aligned}$$

- Sum of the elements $\Sigma : List[Nat] \rightarrow Nat$

Functions between different domains

- The Length function $|\cdot| : List[\star] \rightarrow Nat$

$$\begin{aligned} |[]| &= 0 \\ |a \cdot \ell| &= s(|\ell|) \end{aligned}$$

- Sum of the elements $\Sigma : List[Nat] \rightarrow Nat$

$$\begin{aligned} \Sigma([]) &= 0 \\ \Sigma(n \cdot \ell) &= n + \Sigma(\ell) \end{aligned}$$

Inductive definition of functions: A General Schema

Let $f : D \times E \rightarrow F$.

- For every constant $c \in D$ and every $e \in E$, define $f(c, e)$ (as an element of F)
- For every constructor $\alpha : D^n \times A \rightarrow D$, for every $e \in E$, define $f(\alpha(x_1, \dots, x_n, a), e)$ using a and $f(x_1, e), \dots, f(x_n, e)$.

Proving facts about functions

- Neutral element:

$$\forall x \in \text{Nat}. \ x * s(0) = s(0) * x = x$$

- Commutativity:

$$\forall x, y \in \text{Nat}. \ x + y = y + x$$

- Associativity:

$$\forall x, y, z \in \text{Nat}. \ x + (y + z) = (x + y) + z$$

- Distributivity:

$$\forall x, y, z \in \text{Nat}. \ x * (y + z) = (x * y) + (x * z)$$

- Idempotence:

$$\forall \ell \in \text{List}[\star]. \ \text{Rev}(\text{Rev}(\ell)) = \ell$$

- Kind of distributivity:

$$\forall \ell_1, \ell_2 \in \text{List}[\star]. \ \text{Rev}(\ell_1 @ \ell_2) = \text{Rev}(\ell_2) @ \text{Rev}(\ell_1)$$

Structural Induction

Let c_1, \dots, c_m be the constants, and let $\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_n$ be the constructors.

$$P(c_1)$$

...

$$P(c_m)$$

$$\left(\bigwedge_{i=1}^{K_1} P(x_i) \right) \Rightarrow P(\alpha_1(x_1, \dots, x_{K_1}))$$

...

$$\left(\bigwedge_{i=1}^{K_n} P(x_i) \right) \Rightarrow P(\alpha_n(x_1, \dots, x_{K_n}))$$

$$\forall x. P(x)$$

Proving Neutrality of 1 for *

$$\forall x \in \text{Nat}. \ x * s(0) = s(0) * x = x$$

Proving Neutrality of 1 for *

$$\forall x \in \text{Nat}. \ x * s(0) = s(0) * x = x$$

- Case $x = 0$.
 - ▶ $0 * s(0) = 0$
 - ▶ $s(0) * 0 = 0 * 0 + 0 = 0 + 0 = 0$

Proving Neutrality of 1 for *

$$\forall x \in \text{Nat}. \ x * s(0) = s(0) * x = x$$

- Case $x = 0$.
 - ▶ $0 * s(0) = 0$
 - ▶ $s(0) * 0 = 0 * 0 + 0 = 0 + 0 = 0$
- Case $x = s(x')$. Induction Hypothesis: $x' * s(0) = s(0) * x' = x'$

Proving Neutrality of 1 for *

$$\forall x \in \text{Nat}. \ x * s(0) = s(0) * x = x$$

- Case $x = 0$.
 - ▶ $0 * s(0) = 0$
 - ▶ $s(0) * 0 = 0 * 0 + 0 = 0 + 0 = 0$
- Case $x = s(x')$. Induction Hypothesis: $x' * s(0) = s(0) * x' = x'$
 - ▶ $s(x') * s(0) = (x' * s(0)) + s(0) = x' + s(0) = s(0) + x' = s(0 + x') = s(x')$
(uses commutativity of +)

Proving Neutrality of 1 for *

$$\forall x \in \text{Nat}. \ x * s(0) = s(0) * x = x$$

- Case $x = 0$.
 - ▶ $0 * s(0) = 0$
 - ▶ $s(0) * 0 = 0 * 0 + 0 = 0 + 0 = 0$
- Case $x = s(x')$. Induction Hypothesis: $x' * s(0) = s(0) * x' = x'$
 - ▶ $s(x') * s(0) = (x' * s(0)) + s(0) = x' + s(0) = s(0) + x' = s(0 + x') = s(x')$
(uses commutativity of +)
 - ▶ $s(0) * s(x') = (0 * s(x')) + s(x') = 0 + s(x') = s(x')$

Proving Commutativity of +

$$\forall x, y \in \text{Nat}. \ x + y = y + x$$

Proving Commutativity of +

$$\forall x, y \in \text{Nat}. \ x + y = y + x$$

- Case $x = 0$. $\Rightarrow x + y = 0 + y = y$
 $\rightsquigarrow \forall y \in \text{Nat}. \ y = y + 0 ?$

Proving Commutativity of +

$$\forall x, y \in \text{Nat}. \ x + y = y + x$$

- Case $x = 0$. $\Rightarrow x + y = 0 + y = y$
 $\rightsquigarrow \forall y \in \text{Nat}. \ y = y + 0 ?$
 - ▶ Case $y = 0$: $y + 0 = 0 + 0 = 0$

Proving Commutativity of +

$$\forall x, y \in \text{Nat}. \ x + y = y + x$$

- Case $x = 0$. $\Rightarrow x + y = 0 + y = y$
 $\rightsquigarrow \forall y \in \text{Nat}. \ y = y + 0 ?$
 - ▶ Case $y = 0$: $y + 0 = 0 + 0 = 0$
 - ▶ Case $y = s(y')$:
 - ★ Induction hypothesis: $y' = y' + 0$
 - ★ $y + 0 = s(y') + 0 = s(y' + 0) = s(y') = y$

Proving Commutativity of +

$$\forall x, y \in \text{Nat}. \ x + y = y + x$$

- Case $x = 0$. $\Rightarrow x + y = 0 + y = y$
 $\rightsquigarrow \forall y \in \text{Nat}. \ y = y + 0 ?$
 - ▶ Case $y = 0$: $y + 0 = 0 + 0 = 0$
 - ▶ Case $y = s(y')$:
 - ★ Induction hypothesis: $y' = y' + 0$
 - ★ $y + 0 = s(y') + 0 = s(y' + 0) = s(y') = y$
- Case $x = s(x')$. Induction Hypothesis: $\forall z \in \text{Nat}. \ x' + z = z + x'$
 $\rightsquigarrow \forall y \in \text{Nat}. \ s(x') + y = y + s(x') ?$

Proving Commutativity of +

$$\forall x, y \in \text{Nat}. \ x + y = y + x$$

- Case $x = 0$. $\Rightarrow x + y = 0 + y = y$
 $\rightsquigarrow \forall y \in \text{Nat}. \ y = y + 0 ?$
 - ▶ Case $y = 0$: $y + 0 = 0 + 0 = 0$
 - ▶ Case $y = s(y')$:
 - ★ Induction hypothesis: $y' = y' + 0$
 - ★ $y + 0 = s(y') + 0 = s(y' + 0) = s(y') = y$
- Case $x = s(x')$. Induction Hypothesis: $\forall z \in \text{Nat}. \ x' + z = z + x'$
 $\rightsquigarrow \forall y \in \text{Nat}. \ s(x') + y = y + s(x') ?$
 - ▶ Case $y = 0$: $s(x') + 0 = s(x' + 0) = s(0 + x') = s(x') = 0 + s(x')$

Proving Commutativity of +

$$\forall x, y \in \text{Nat}. \ x + y = y + x$$

- Case $x = 0$. $\Rightarrow x + y = 0 + y = y$
 $\rightsquigarrow \forall y \in \text{Nat}. \ y = y + 0 ?$
 - ▶ Case $y = 0$: $y + 0 = 0 + 0 = 0$
 - ▶ Case $y = s(y')$:
 - ★ Induction hypothesis: $y' = y' + 0$
 - ★ $y + 0 = s(y') + 0 = s(y' + 0) = s(y') = y$
- Case $x = s(x')$. Induction Hypothesis: $\forall z \in \text{Nat}. \ x' + z = z + x'$
 $\rightsquigarrow \forall y \in \text{Nat}. \ s(x') + y = y + s(x') ?$
 - ▶ Case $y = 0$: $s(x') + 0 = s(x' + 0) = s(0 + x') = s(x') = 0 + s(x')$
 - ▶ Case $y = s(y')$:
 - ★ Induction hypothesis: $s(x') + y' = y' + s(x')$
 - ★ $s(x') + s(y') = s(x' + s(y')) = s(s(y') + x') = s(s(y' + x'))$
 - ★ $s(y') + s(x') = s(y' + s(x')) = s(s(x') + y') = s(s(x' + y'))$
 - ★ $s(s(x' + y')) = s(s(y' + x'))$

Summary

- The first step in defining a function is to define its type (its domain and its co-domain).
- Infinite data domain can be defined inductively (set of constants and a set of constructors).
- Functions over infinite data domains by reasoning on the inductive structure of the data domains.
- Facts about recursive functions can be proved by reasoning on the inductive structure of the data domains.